Multi-level governance, REDD+ and synergies between climate change mitigation and adaptation (Brazil & Indonesia)

Monica Di Gregorio
SRI, University of Leeds, June 10th, 2014
Aim

- This study aims to explore the extent to which policy processes related to forest-based mitigation and adaptation can be integrated in order to deliver more effective outcomes and how existing governance constraints to such integration can be overcome.
Research questions

- Which kind of synergies/trade-offs exist between forest mitigation and adaptation?
- How can multi-level policy processes be integrated in order to better exploit existing synergies between forest mitigation and adaptation (and addressing existing trade-offs)?
- How can existing governance constraints to such integration be overcome and existing opportunities for integration be realised?
Why synergies between mitigation and adaptation?

Is it mutually beneficial to address M & A together? = do we need policy integration?
Why investigate multi-level governance?

Global benefits
• Mitigation: carbon emission reductions

Local benefits
• Adaptation: environmental services, livelihood diversification

Global governance
• UNFCCC, global standards, multi-lateral initiatives

National governance
• bilateral initiatives, REDD+ strategies, Adaptation plans and policies

Local governance
• REDD+ and adaptation policies, projects and outcomes
Multi-level governance

- ‘The point of departure for … multi-level governance is the existence of overlapping competencies among multiple levels of governments and the interaction of political actors across those levels. … Instead of the two level game assumptions adopted by state centrists, MLG theorists posit a set of overarching, multi-level policy networks.’ (Marks et al. 1996: 41-2).

→ 'the notion of 'policy networks' does not so much represent a new analytical perspective but rather signals a real change in the structure of the polity’ (Mayntz 1994: 5).
Policy Networks: the relational dimension of governance

- Policy networks are formed by patterns of interactions and resource interdependencies between policy actors (Smith 1997)

- These interdependencies reveal how organizations bargain with one another in order to affect policy outcomes (Laumann and Knoke 1987)
Multi-level governance

- Cross-level interactions among scale-dependent regimes can have 5 patterns (Young 2006):
  - dominance; separation; merger; negotiated agreement; system change
- The mechanisms that determine which of these patterns will occur include:
  - authority/power differentials, level (and limits) of decentralization, contrasting discourses, cognitive transitions, and (blocking) coalitions
Locations & jurisdictions:

- Brazil
  - Federal
  - Mato Grosso
    - State
    - Municipalities: Alta Floresta + 1

- Indonesia
  - National
  - West Kalimantan / Central Java Provinces
    - District: Kapuas Hulu
Analytical Methods

- Policy Analysis
  - Level of/potential for integration of mitigation and adaptation policies
- Policy Network Analysis (PNA)
  - Interactions among M&A policy actors within/across levels
- Discourse Analysis
  - Policy actors’ understanding of synergies, scope for integration & challenges to realizing synergies
Policy Analysis

Policy document analysis
- laws, M&A policies, plans, initiatives & related programmes
- Nvivo
- Initial themes + open coding

→ CC policy architecture and analysis of levels of/potential for integration between M&A policies (forests & agric.)
Mapping of actors involved in the M&A policy domain:

- List of state and non-state actors (orgs)
  - International, national, sub-national
  - Multi-level, multi-sector actors or venues

- Source: policy analysis, key informants, media, literature
Policy network survey

Survey with representatives of organizations:

• Orgs’ activities: mitigation/adaptation & integrated action

• Networks questions:
  ▪ Interactions with other policy actors
  ▪ Participation in multi-level, multi-actor venues/forums related to M & A policies

• Stances (agreement/disagreement) with statements about synergies
Policy Network Questions

- Full roaster of actors (national / 1 state/province / 2 districts/municipalities)

- Question about influence:
  1. Which orgs are particularly influential in the M / A policy domain? (reputational power) (N1M / N1A)

- Questions about interactions:
  2. With which orgs does your org regularly exchange information about M / about A / integrated approaches? (N2M / N2A/ N2 I)
  3. With which orgs does your org regularly collaborate on M / on A / on integrated policy making or actions? (N3M / N3A / N3 Int)

- Question about participation in venues:
  4. In which multi-level or multi-actor venues related to M & A has your organization participated in the last 12 months? (N4) Were synergies discussed?
Semi-structured interviews

- Interviews with policy actors (complements networks Qs):
  - How actors understand synergies between M & A in forest/agricultural systems
  - Their opinions on pro/cons of integrated action;
  - Participation and satisfaction with cross-level policy processes
  - Level of policy integration, opportunities and challenges to pursue integrated approaches?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Scale</th>
<th>N1 Mit</th>
<th>N1 Adap</th>
<th>N2 Mitig</th>
<th>N2Adap</th>
<th>N2 Integ</th>
<th>N3 Mit</th>
<th>N3 Adapt</th>
<th>N3 Integ</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of Environment</td>
<td>Nat Government</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of Finance</td>
<td>Nat Government</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of Public Works</td>
<td>Nat Government</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UKP4</td>
<td>Nat Government</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Badan Koordinasi Survei dan Pemetaan</td>
<td>Nat Government</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dewan Nasional Perubahan Iklim</td>
<td>Nat Government</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pemerintah Daerah Kalimantan</td>
<td>Nat Government</td>
<td>L</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCROM</td>
<td>Research/Academ</td>
<td>N</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asosiasi Pengusaha Hutan Indonesia</td>
<td>Private Sector</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asosiasi Pertambangan Indonesia</td>
<td>Private Sector</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kamar Dagang Indonesia</td>
<td>Private Sector</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PT. Sumalindo Lestari Jaya Tbk</td>
<td>Private Sector</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burung Indonesia</td>
<td>Intern. NGO</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Samdhana Institute</td>
<td>National NGO</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yayasan Telapak</td>
<td>National NGO</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yayasan Pelangi</td>
<td>National NGO</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yayasan WWF Indonesia</td>
<td>International NGO</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fauna &amp; Flora International - Indon</td>
<td>International NGO</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Nature Conservancy</td>
<td>International NGO</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conservation International Indones</td>
<td>International NGO</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>World Resources Institute</td>
<td>International NGO</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clinton Foundation</td>
<td>International NGO</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German Development Cooperation</td>
<td>Donor Government</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Center for International Forestry Research</td>
<td>International Org</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>World Agroforestry Centre (ICRAF)</td>
<td>International Org</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN-REDD</td>
<td>International Org</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government of Australia</td>
<td>Donor Government</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GIZ</td>
<td>Donor Government</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan International Cooperation Agency</td>
<td>Donor Government</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of Forestry</td>
<td>National Governmnet</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of Agriculture</td>
<td>National Governmnet</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMAN Kalteng</td>
<td>National NGO</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kemitranan Kalteng</td>
<td>National NGO</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Comparing M, A and integrated networks

Collabor. on Mitigation  Collabor. on Adaptation  Integrated approach

National

Local
Determinants of cross-level relations

- **Dominance (power differentials across scales)** based on:
  - Reputational power
  - Centrality, Brokerage across levels.....

- **Coalitions**: based on density of interactions
  - Do coalitions cross levels?
  - Do dense interactions reflect a common understanding of synergies?
Combining PNA & discourse analysis

Discourse coalition

Actor Network

Affiliation Network

Concept Network

Actors

Concepts

\( a_1 \) \( a_2 \) \( a_3 \) \( a_4 \) \( a_5 \)

\( c_1 \) \( c_2 \) \( c_3 \) \( c_4 \) \( c_5 \)
Answering the RQs...

- How can multi-level policy processes be integrated in order to better exploit existing synergies between forest mitigation and adaptation (while recognising existing trade-offs)?

- How can existing governance constraints to such integration be overcome and existing opportunities for integration be realised?

Drawing on:

- CC policy architecture, cross-scale network analysis, interviews

- Structural (institutions, network structures) and ideational constraints → new institutions/mandates (coordinating bodies), participatory venues, cognitive change…?
Thanks!

This research is funded by the Economic and Social Research Council of the United Kingdom [grant number ES/K00879X/1] and the Australian Government.